Appendix B: Data Extraction Chart

Author	Year of Publi- cation	Title	Data- base	Journal		DOI/ URL	Needs Identified	Barriers Identified	Facilitators Identified	Recommendations
Alison Tweed, Andrew Singfield, Julia RA Taulor, Lucy Gilbert, Paul Mount	2018	Creating Allegiance: Leading transformati onal change within the NHS	EMCA RE	BMJ Leader	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.113 6/leade r-2018- 000088			1) Intrinsic value of leadership - Leaders should be non-partisan integrators rather than assign themselves to an organisation - have an allegiance to the system. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Leaders should build high quality relationships involving emotional intelligence and positive role modelling. 3) Organisational Culture - Shared visions (espoused theories) need to be outlined and translated into everyday practice and visions of previous leaders or schemes must be erased. 4) Workforce Management - Connecting through practice: involving frontline staff and all stakeholders in decisions and key pieces of the transformation to integrated care.	1) Intrinsic value of leadership - Connecting is a key theme in managing system or transformational change and occurs through three mediums: relational, with purpose and vision and through practice. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - To further research the concept of allegiance creation as it appears under-represented within the literature, particularly as part of the process of transformational change, rather than as an outcome of change or behaviours towards leaders.
Anna Charles, Lillie Wenzel, Matthew Kershaw, Chris Ham, Nicola Walsh	2018	A Year of Integrated Care Systems: Reviewing the journey so far	N/A - Snowb all	The King's Fund	Report	URL: https:// www.ki ngsfun d.org.u k/sites/ default/ files/20 18- 09/Yea r-of- integrat ed- care- system s-		Political - The legislative context does not support system working. Political - Regulation and oversight is not aligned. Organisational Culture - A legacy of competitive behaviours.	Inter-organisational Collaboration- Collaborative relationships. Inter-organisational Collaboration- Partnerships with local authorities. Organisational Culture - Shared vision and purpose. Organisational Culture - A meaningful local identity.	Inter-organisational Collaboration-Invest in building collaborative relationships at all levels of the system. Intrinsic value of leadership - Promote and value system leadership. Workforce Management - Integrate at different levels of the system,

						reviewi ng- journey -so-far- full- report.p	4) Organisational Culture - Frequently changing language and the lack of a clear narrative. 5) Economic - Leaders face competing demands. 6) Economic - Funding pressures.	 5) Intrinsic value of leadership - System leadership. 6) Intrinsic value of leadership - Clinical leadership and engagement. 7) Workforce Management - Established models of integrated working. 8) Economic - Stability of local finances and performance. 9) Economic - Funding to support transformation. 10) Political - A permissive and supportive national programme. 	building up from places and neighbourhoods. 4) Workforce Management - Draw on the skills and leadership of frontline staff. 5) Workforce Management - Build governance in an evolutionary way to support delivery. 6) Workforce Management - Develop system-wide capabilities to gather, share and act on public insights. 7) Workforce Management - Develop active strategies to facilitate wider adoption of new care models. 8) Workforce Management - Build robust evaluation into the ICS programme that supports learning and improvement and measures progress.
Axel Kaehne, Alison J Petch, Robin Stewart Miller	2017	Bringing Integration Home: Policy on health and social care integration in the four nations of the UK	BNI	Journal of Integrate d Care	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.110 8/JICA- 12- 2016- 0049	Inter-organisational Collaboration- Inadequate collaboration continues to result in poor quality, efficiency and effectiveness of care. Organisational Culture - Culture of impatience and cynicism. Workforce Management - Inadequate workforce planning. Inter-organisational Collaboration- Lack of evidence on how the third sector and independent services would be involved.		To further research specific policy analysis domains, i.e. investigate policy formation, policy implementation or service delivery outcomes in integrated or coordinated health and social care services.

		goveri 6) Ecc agree 7) Pol under driver: requir succe betwe	contical - Complex rnance arrangements. conomic - Difficulties in eing budgets. colitical - Lack of erstanding of what the rs and essential irements are for essful integration een health and social and how to use policy	
		to stee	and how to use policy eer care organisations igh this change.	

	looking at individual organisations. 6) Workforce Management - Integration was less of a priority where stakeholders had urgent competing demands (e.g. meeting 4-hour waiting time A&E targets). 7) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Some Pioneers were very complex with a large 8) Workforce Management involvement in developing integration initiatives and encouraging their 'ownersh new service models. 9) Political - Supportive legical to the properties of	p' of slation. t - t -
	8) Collaboration between Organisation - Inadequate local engagement/'buy-in' of the independent, community and voluntary sectors, in part, because they were often required to compete against each other for contracts, making working together particularly challenging. 9) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Inadequate local engagement/'buy-in' of the mental health sector, due in part to the legacy of underfunding and 'Cinderella' status of the sector. 10) Inter-organisational Collaboration- In some Pioneers with multiple partners, a sense that	ot f g new earning staff so

			transformation could		
			happen only at the page	e of	
			the falswest' most	6 01	
			the 'slowest', most		
			conservative or risk av	erse	
			stakeholder.		
			11) Economic - PbR		
			incentives for acute		
			providers to increase		
			providers to increase		
			activity against providi	ng	
			more care outside hos	oital.	
			12) Economic -		
			Commissioning		
			organisations were		
			sometimes reluctant to		
I	1				
I	1		pool budgets as it mea	nτ	
I	1		giving up complete cor	trol	
I	1		over their own budget	n	
			order to have influence		
			over a larger one.		
			over a larger one.		
			13) Inter-organisationa		
			13) inter-organisationa	<u> </u>	
			Collaboration- Informa	ion	
			sharing was seen as		
			critical, but the level of		
			integration of informati		
			and intelligence neede		
			was technically difficult	10	
			achieve across multiple	e IT	
			platforms and with		
			obstructive information		
			governance regulation		
	1		governance regulation	, .	
			14) Organisational Cul	ture	
I			- Differences between	une	
I			health and social care		
	1		sectors in terms of		
	1		language and concept	ons	
			of health and wellbeing		
I	1				
			professional cultures a	iiu	
I			working practices.		
I			. <u>.</u> .		
			15) Organisational Cul	ture	
			- Different priorities		
I	1		between professions:	e.a.	
			the people of most cor	cern	
I	1		to social workers were	not	
	<u> </u>		to social workers were	HOL	

.	1 1		I	
			necessarily the same as	
			those of most concern to	
			GPs.	
			16) Organisational Culture	
			- 'Blame culture' within and	
			across local health and	
			social care sectors located	
			responsibility for failures in	
			integration elsewhere in	
			the system.	
			17) Intrinsic value of	
			leadership - Lack of	
			agreement on priorities	
			among local system leaders.	
			lieauers.	
			18) Workforce	
			Management - Multiple	
			challenges of engaging	
			frontline staff	
			10, 0	
			19) Organisational Culture	
			- Scepticism about NHS	
			initiatives that had previously been seen to	
			'come and go'.	
			come and go .	
			20) Organisational Culture	
			- Previous initiatives did	
			not live up to expectations	
			leading to demoralisation.	
			21) Workforce	
			Management - Difficulties	
			recruiting staff particularly	
			in certain areas of the	
			country.	
			22) Workforce	
			Management - High staff	
			turnover (especially	
			following health care	
			reforms) negatively	
			affected longer-term	
			strategic planning and	
		 	I.	

			service provision aiming for integration. 23) Organisational Culture - Promoting a 'play-it-safe' work culture can be detrimental to 'barrier busting'. 24) Existing approaches to training professionals do not produce trainees equipped for integrated working, and not enough trainees to meet demand.	
--	--	--	--	--

Carolyn Wilkins	2020	An Allied Approach to Success in Oldham	НМІС	Municipal Journal	ive	URL: https:// www.th emj.co. uk/An- allied- approa ch-to- succes s-in- Oldha m/2166 93#		1) Political - Co-operative council with an understanding of communities which helps to target resources and further develop interventions. 2) Organisational Culture - Positive and trusting relationships. 3) Organisational Culture - A culture of innovation, creativity and empowerment and not micromanagement based on old fashioned contractual approaches. 4) Intrinsic value of leadership - System leaders who work together to support frontline practitioners to overcome bureaucratic barriers.	
Chris Ham, Judith Smith and Elizabeth Eastmure	2011	Commission ing integrated care in a liberated NHS	Nuffield Trust	Nuffield Trust		URL: https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/rese arch/co mmissi oning- integrat ed- care-in- a- liberate d-nhs	Economic - Needs assessment and service specification is time, effort and resource consuming.	Economic - Using PMS and APMS contracts to facilitate payments. Intrinsic value of leadership - Managerial leadership in combination with clinician leadership.	

I	1	1	1	1	1	DO1	In the second se
Danial	2019	The general		BMJ	Qualitat	DOI: 10.113	1) Workforce Management
Naqvi,		practice	SE	OPEN	ive	6/bmjo	- Lack of awareness of
Anam		perspective			Study	pen-	roles and services:
Malik,		on barriers				2019-	uncertainty about which
Mohaimen		to				029702	roles are carried out by
Al-		integration					which social service
Zubaidy,		between					provider and how best to
Falak		primary and					contact these individuals.
Naqvi,		social care:					
Anas		a London,					2) Inter-organisational
Tahir, Ali		United					Collaboration- Often
Tarfiee,		Kingdom-					numbers in practice diaries
Sarina		based					and on websites are out of
Vara, and		qualitative					date, so staff have to ask
Edgar		interview					the patient directly what
Meyer		study					social care they receive
IVICYCI		Study					and how to contact
							relevant departments,
							slowing down both
							communication and any
							attempts at collaborative
							working.
							3) Workforce Management
							- Overworked staff: local
							pressures have led to an
							increase in workload and
							time constraints reduce the
							motivation to collaborate
							with other sectors to
							develop new methods of
							service provision.
							4) Inter-organisational
							Collaboration-
							Communication between
							primary care and social
							care is logistically
							challenging, as doctors are
							busy with patients during
							the day and social care
							staff are working in the
							community, making joint
							conversations about
							patients nearly impossible.

S) Organisational Culture- All participants precieved

							10) Economic - Insufficient funding. 11) Inter-organisational Collaboration-Interoperability between information systems: the lack of shared information systems.	
DOH	2008	The Evidence Base for Integrated Care	HMIC	DOH	Report	URL: https:// webarc hive.na tionalar chives. gov.uk/ 201301 240441 56/http: //www. dh.gov. uk/prod _consu m_dh/g roups/d h_digit alasset s/@dh/@en/d ocume nts/digit alasset/ dh_089 371.pdf		1) Workforce Management - The objectives of integration need to be made explicit. 2) Workforce Management - Begin integration at the frontline, which impacts directly on the patient experience; based on this, the most apt organisational supports for service provision might be identified. 3) Workforce Management - The right incentives: it is important that frontline staff recognise and buy into the integration process. 4) Organisational Culture - A culture of quality improvement. 5) Organisational Culture - A history of trust between partner organisations. 6) Organisational Culture - Personnel who are open to collaboration and innovation. 7) Organisational Culture - Awareness of local cultural differences: organisational cultures evolve separately over decades.

									8) Intrinsic value of leadership - Local leaders who are supportive of integration. 9) Inter-organisational Collaboration-Effective and complementary communications and IT systems. 10) Political - Be patient: the time required to implement effective integration is a recurrent theme and is unsurprising given the changes required. It takes time to effect demonstrable changes in organisational structures and processes; and to have these filter down to outcomes.
E Paice, S Hasan	2013	Educating for Integrated Care	PubMe d	London Journal of Primary Care	Report	013.11	culture in which people are comfortable and competent in working across organisational boundaries to serve the needs of patients more effectively and strive continuously to improve the quality of care.	1) Economic - Financial incentives do not encourage collaboration. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Financial incentives do not encourage collaboration. 3) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Lack of shared data. 4) Organisational Culture - Lack of shared accountability.	

Elena Urizar, Roberto Nuño, Caridad Alvarez, Fernández Concepció n, Carles Blay, Andrea Quiroga	2018	Barriers and facilitators for the implementati on of Integrated Care Pathways ICPs: a systemic perspective	CINAH	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.533 4/ijic.s2 131	1) Organisational Cultu At macro level there is general lack of strategivision towards integrat care from a systems perspective. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- At mesolevel, the historical fragmentation of organizations poses a strong challenge towar care coordination. 3) Intrinsic value of leadership - At the miclevel a lack of clinical leadership and buy-in hinders the needed multidisciplinary and collaborative work.	Collaboration- Better Information Systems. 2) Organisational Culture - Strategic Alignment. 3) Workforce Management - Improving data collection, continuous monitoring and evaluation, feedback looping to professionals. 4) Workforce Management - Incentives and training healthcare professionals in communication
Gerald Wistow, Matt Gaskins, Holly Holder, Judith Smith	2016	Why implementin g integrated care is so much harder than designing it: experience in North West London.	CINAH L	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: http://d oi.org/1 0.5334/ ijic.285 6	1) Workforce Manager - Balance between: collective leadership al local autonomy; integrated provision; N leadership and local authority engagement; local variation and programme-wide consistency; investment design and support for ongoing implementation and change. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Systems leadership. NHS leade have relatively little tra or experience in mana systems as opposed to organisations.	design, inclusivity (especially of lay partners), an openness to learning. 2) Workforce Management - A clear, timetabled route map, together with roles of the programme management team and its resources were seen as valuable enablers.

							3) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Securing data-sharing and information governance. 4) Economic - Developing payment and accountability systems aligned with integrated care objectives. 5) Workforce Management - Maintaining acute provider viability while reducing hospital admissions. 6) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Balancing competition and collaboration.		
Gwyn Bevan ; Katharina Janus	2011	Why hasn't integrated health care developed widely in the United States and not at all in England?	PubMe d	Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law.	Report	DOI: 10.121 5/0361 6878- 119113 5.		1) Workforce Management - Governance by hierarchy (ownership) or a mode that is close to a hierarchy (through long- term contractual relationships). 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Full integration compared with arrangements of different autonomous insurers and providers reduces costs of information, negotiation, contracting, control, and adaptation and is hence more efficient. 3) Economic - Finance by capitation. Payment per member for coverage for all care provided by the IHCDS (typically in an annual contract with monthly payments), as the principal reimbursement method acts as a powerful pricing strategy that generates substantial savings	

								through internal incentives for preventive care. 4) Economic - A commitment to cost control and high-quality care. 5) Workforce Management - Good management and information systems. In a well-organized IHCDS, tight management controls its bureaucratic costs (which can otherwise result in hierarchy failure), sophisticated data management enables it to react quickly to developments in health care and markets, and standardisation in care management facilitates health care provision and thereby economises on transaction costs. 6) Workforce Management - Durability and size.	
Hermina Harnagea, Yves Couturier, Richa Shrivastav a, Felix Girard, Lise Lamothe, Christophe Pierre Bedos, Elham Emami	2017	Barriers and facilitators in the integration of oral health into primary care: a scoping review	HMIC	BMJ Open	Scopin g Review	DOI: 10.113 6/bmjo pen- 2017- 016078	1) Political - Lack of political leadership and healthcare policies and a poor understanding of the population and low prioritisation on the political agenda as well the absence of appropriate policies at the macro level. 2) Economic - The cost of integrated services, human resources issues (workload of personnel, staff turnover, time constraints and scarcity of various trained human resources such as care coordinators, public health workforce and allied professionals) and deficient administrative infrastructure (the absence of health records, cross-	1) Economic - Supportive policies and resource allocation: financial support from governments, stakeholders and non-profit organisations at the macro level. 2) Workforce Management - Interprofessional education. 3) Workforce Management - Three subthemes: perceived responsibility and role identification, case management [including choice and flexibility in service delivery at multiple levels (administrative and/or clinical)] and incremental approach (gradual modification in the workflow based on staff experience and preference). 4) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Geographical	

								proximity of interdisciplinary organisations. 5) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Partnerships and common vision among governments, communities, academia, various stakeholders and non-profit organisations. 6) Intrinsic value of leadership - The strategic role of the local leader in building teamwork and communities' capacities.	
Jenna M. Evans, Agnes Grudniewi cz, G. Ross Baker, Walter P. Wodchis	2016	Organization al Context and Capabilities for Integrating Care: A Framework for Improvemen t	HSE	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	System atic Literatu re Review	10.533	1) Workforce Management - Basic Structures and Design: Physical Structures, Human and Material Resources, Organizational Design, Governance, Accountability, and Information Technology. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Leadership and Strategy: Leadership Approach, Clinician Engagement and Leadership, Strategic Focus on Improvement,		

							and Performance Measurement. 3) Organisational Culture - Social and Psychological Context: Readiness for Change, Organisational Culture, and Work Environment. 4) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Processes: Partnering, Teamwork, Delivering Care, and Improving Quality.			
John Deffenbau gh	2018	Becoming an integrated (accountabl e) care system	EMCA RE	British Journal of Health Care Manage ment	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.129 68/bjhc .2018.2 4.4.175	their organisation	leadership - System leadership is harder than organisational leadership - there are conflicting performance measures.	Intrinsic value of leadership - Leaders understanding the motivation of partners enabling unconditional commitment, collective ownership - debts, income etc.	1) Organisational Culture - Stop clashes and set a common goal (no PBR from NHSI conflicting with CCGs from NHSE) - end artificial divides. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Longterm perspective needs to be maintained and the stakeholders must be motivated. 3) Intrinsic value of leadership - Leadership roles must change to become facilitators of change (no more competition).

							citizens and communities. 8) Intrinsic value of leadership - Leaders who get along.		
Judith Smith, Gerald Wistow, Holly Holder & Matthew Gaskins	2019	Evaluating the design and implementati on of the whole systems integrated care programme in North West London: why commissioning proved (again) to be the weakest link.	d	BMC Health Services Research	atic Literatu	DOI: 10.118 6/s129 13-019- 4013-5.		1) Organisational Culture - Social and cultural differences including those related to knowledge, organisation and power. 2) Political - The Health and Social Care Act 2012 re-emphasised the role of competition and implicitly encouraged more extensive use of for-profit and third sector providers alongside mainstream NHS-managed services. Yet there has been a parallel emphasis on collaboration and integration so Commissioners have therefore had to explore ways of balancing apparently contradictory pressures: to promote provider competition through contracting and procurement, while simultaneously securing collaborative service delivery through strategic purchasing.	1) Workforce Management - Define specifically what changes to services are intended. 2) Workforce Management - Convene stakeholders to plan for and support implementation continuously. 3) Workforce Management - See outcomes as something for which commissioners and providers are jointly accountable.

Kasper Raus, Eric Mortier & Kristof Eeckloo	2020	Challenges in turning a great idea into great health policy: the case of integrated care	PubMe	BMC Health Services Research	Пороге	DOI: 10.118 6/s129 13-020-4950-z.	coir dirth quantity of the color of the colo	pholitical - Conceptual hallenges: lack of clarity on what constitutes integrated care. When trafting and implementing integrated care, there are incee fundamental questions that should be considered by every policynaker: (1) how the integration will be organised; (2) what kind of integration is intended; (3) what outcome is intended. Because of the conceptual omplexity and ideological hoices, it is particularly lifficult to determine when and to what degree integration of care is a success. Pholitical - Empirical hallenges: when drafting policy on integrated care, policymakers are likely to make use of the available empirical evidence. There are at least three different ources of such evidence. First, policymakers might earn from places where policies on integrated care have already been put into place. Second, policymakers can make use of the available esearch literature. Third, policymakers can gather heir own data. However, each of these sources of evidence can pose ubstantial challenges. Successfully transferring policy requires not just earning about particular policy requires not just earning about particular policy (such as by reading	1) Political - Reflect on the type and level of integration you want to promote. As we have argued, integrated care is a broad concept that encompasses various sorts of integration and collaboration. It is necessary as a policymaker to be aware of the level of integration that you want to achieve as, without proper prior thought, it will be impossible to determine the success of the policy afterwards. 2) Political - Reflect beforehand on what you hope to achieve with integrated care. We have argued throughout that integrated care should be seen as a means to a number of possible ends (e.g., economic efficiency or increased quality of care). Knowing what one hopes to achieve by promoting integrated care is crucial to being able to later evaluate the success or failure of the policy. This also allows policymakers to install a mechanism for evaluation, allowing the health policy to be re-evaluated after a period. 3) Political - Tailor policy to the particular context in which it will be implemented. The successful integration of a given policy in a particular health care context might not be automatically transferrable to another health care context. Policymakers should critically assess the available scientific literature and look at examples of places where comparable policies have been implemented. One cannot simply copy policy from somewhere else and expect it to work. Policymakers should preferably not only learn about what happened in other places, but instead learn from other places.
								earning about particular olicy (such as by reading	instead learn nom other places.

Lours	2012	The east	LIMIO		Sustan	DOI:	policy documents), but also learning from particular policies. Policymakers can make use of an increasing amount of existing and published evidence from research, however, how to translate this knowledge into political action is far from evident. Also, while many case studies have been published there may be publication or reporting bias, whereby successful networks are more likely to be published than unsuccessful ones. 3) Economic - Resource challenges: integrated care is often believed to allow for 'improved efficiency of services, and reduced overall cost', however there is research suggesting that creating integrated care and health care collaborations might actually require a great investment of resources before there is any efficiency pay-off. The resources needed are:(1) expertise, (2) time, and (3) funding.		4) Economic - Be committed to investing the resources needed to genuinely run and evaluate a policy. Research shows how successfully promoting integration may require resources such as time, expertise, and funding. As we have argued, policy-makers who fail to invest the necessary amount of money might afterwards incorrectly conclude that a particular policy implementation does not work. 5) Organisational Culture - Provide the stakeholders with sufficient freedom and autonomy. Research shows that successful integration cannot be fully mandated and requires a willingness from stakeholders and a relationship of trust between them. 6) Political - Consider beforehand how the actual implementation of the policy can be evaluated: Despite there being empirical challenges, a lot can be learned from the example of other countries and the experiences of other policy makers. There is also the option of setting up pilot projects or policy experiments to gather relevant feedback. Finally, policy makers should also consider the installation and use of feedback mechanisms to gain insight into the implementation of policy once it is underway.
Laura G. González- Ortiz, Stefano Calciolari, Viktoria Stein, Nick Goodwin	2018	The core dimensions of integrated care: a literature review to support the developmen t of a	HMIC	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	-4:-	DOI: 10.533 4/ijic.41 98		Intrinsic value of leadership - Local leadership and long-term commitments. Intrinsic value of leadership - Leaders with a clear vision on integrated care.	

		comprehens ive framework for implementin g integrated care.						3) Intrinsic value of leadership - Distributed leadership. 4) Intrinsic value of leadership - Managerial leadership. 5) Intrinsic value of leadership - Visionary leadership. 6) Intrinsic value of leadership - Clinical leadership. 7) Intrinsic value of leadership - Organisational leadership for providing optimal chronic care. 8) Organisational Culture - Shared vision and values for the purpose of integrated care. 9) Organisational Culture - An integration culture institutionalised through policies and procedures. 10) Organisational Culture - Striving towards an open culture for discussing possible improvements for care partners. 11) Organisational Culture - Linking cultures. 12) Organisational Culture - Trust (on colleagues, caregivers and organisations). 13) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Information sharing. 14) Planned/organised meetings.	
Mahiben Maruthapp u	2016	Enablers and Barriers in Implementin g Integrated Care	N/A - Snowb all	Health Systems and Reform	Report	DOI: 10.108 0/2328 8604.2 015.10 77301	A change of culture is required, at both clinical	 Political - Supportive regulation. Political - Flexible administrative reorganisation. Economic - Funding realignment. 	

							problems in the long-term sustainability of integration. 2) Economic - For integrative care to be successful, a long-term plan with adequately protected support and funding must be provided. Financial incentives must be directed toward integrated pathways and designed to redistribute incentives to stakeholders. 3) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Without an infrastructure framework, the coordination of care is stifled; for example, robust shared electronic patient record platforms, which can be accessed by all those involved in providing care to the target patient population.	4) Economic - Identification of target population. 5) Economic - Adequate financing. 6) Inter-organisational Collaboration- IT infrastructure. 7) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Leadership coalition. 8) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Involvement of primary, community and social care. 9) Workforce Management - Evaluation models. 10) Organisational Culture - Common values. 11) Organisational Culture - Changing clinical cultures. 12) Intrinsic value of leadership - Clinical Leadership.	
Martin Bardsley, Adam Steventon, Judith Smith and Jennifer Dixon	2013	Evaluating integrated and community-based care	Nuffield Trust	Nuffield Trust	Report	URL: https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/rese arch/ev aluatin g- integrat ed-and- commu nity- based- care- how- do-we- know- what- works		scale service changes takes time e.g. Kaiser Permanente. 2) Workforce Management - Defining the intervention clearly and what it is meant to achieve	Intrinsic value of leadership - Blend designated leadership with distributed leadership. Workforce Management - Establish feedback loops. Workforce Management - Engage physicians, patients and families.

								will have specific success factors but the aim must be the same.	
NHS Future Forum	2011	Clinical advice and leadership: a report from the NHS Future Forum.	HMIC	N/A	Report	em/upl oads/at tachme nt_data /file/21	Management - Data about quality and outcomes of care is collected, shared and		

							organisations, particularly new ones, should ensure that appropriate leadership development and support are in place. 7) Workforce Management - Responsible officers continuing to be in place to support doctors in improving care and ensuring their fitness to practice through revalidation. 8) Organisational Culture - Strong and visible clinical and professional leadership at all levels, focused on increasing trust and encouraging positive behaviour.			
NHS Leadershi p Academy	2018	Leadership in Integrated Care Systems (ICSs)	N/A - Snowb all	Social Care Institute for Excellenc e: Future of Care	Report	URL: https:// www.sc ie.org.u k/integr ated- care/le adershi p/syste ms#furt her info	b) having a strong focus on outcomes and population health c) building strong relationships with other leaders, and often working with them informally to develop joint priorities and plans d) establishing	1) Workforce Management - Strategies and agendas that are imposed by NHS England on local areas rather than being clinically- led and driven by local need. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Lack of coordination and alignment at national level between NHS England and NHS Improvement. 3) Workforce Management - Complex accountability structures and configurations. 4) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Different performance regimes and	positions across organisations. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Relationships before structures: drawing on established working relationships built over the years. 3) Workforce Management - Involving staff and service users. 4) Organisational Culture - Having the security to make long-term plans. 5) Organisational Culture - Trust and delegation of autonomy from	1) Leadership Style - Leadership programmes and professional development opportunities. 2) Organisational Culture - Peer support including mechanisms for 'buddying up'. 3) Workforce Management - Local champions who will push and progress the work, and 'win hearts and minds'. 4) Workforce Management - Skilled external facilitation, to help deliver complex programmes. 5) Organisational Culture - The creation of 'safe spaces' for leaders to meet with peers and share problems and solutions.

	where the commitment and energy is strongest e) setting the overall outcomes and expectations on behaviours, but handing day-to-day decision-making to others f) supporting the development of multidisciplinary teams (MDTs) g) designing and facilitating whole-systems events and workshops to build consensus and deliver change h) understanding and leading cultural change i) building system-wide learning and evaluation frameworks j) fostering a learning culture across the whole system.	the NHS and local authorities. 5) Political - Lack of a coherent view of whole population needs. 6) Political - Sheer volume of bureaucracy involved in getting service changes through. 7) Workforce Management - Insufficient development, support and peer support for leaders.	6) Workforce Management - Clarity about how performance will be judged. 7) Workforce Management - Clarity about how accountability will work, and responsibilities of individual organisations.	6) Organisational Culture - More opportunities to learn from other professions and sectors. 7) Workforce Management - Systems leadership development for middle managers across the system. 8) Workforce Management - Masterclasses on: co-production theory and practice, finance and risk-sharing, scaling innovation, understanding local government and social care, large-scale and large-group facilitation, working and influencing across multiple layers of governance.
--	---	---	--	--

							challenged by bureaucratic constraints. 14) Organisational Culture - Performance management and assurance processes that are not aligned to learning and self-reflection. 15) Organisational Culture - A sense that the goalposts keep moving with priorities, funding and expectations changing.	
Nick Goodwin and Judith Smith	2011	The Evidence Base for Integrated Care	N/A - Snowb all	The King's Fund and the Nuffield Trust: Developing a National Strategy for the Promotion of Integrate d Care	Present ation	URL: https:// www.ki ngsfun d.org.u k/sites/ default/ files/Evi dence- base- integrat ed- care2.p df		
Nick Goodwin, Judith Smith, Alisha Davies, Claire Perry, Rebecca Rosen, Anna Dixon, Jennifer	2012	Integrated care for patients and populations: Improving outcomes by working together	Trust	Nuffield Trust	Report	URL: https:// www.ki ngsfun d.org.u k/public ations/i ntegrat ed- care- patient s-and- populat ions- improvi ng- outcom es- working	1) Organisational Culture - NHS management is permission based and has a risk averse approach where innovation is needed. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Divide between primary/secondary, health/social care: different contracts, employment, free/means tested.	Intrinsic value of leadership - Setting a clear, ambitious and measurable goal to improve the experience of patients and service users, implement change at scale and pace.

Dixon, Chris Ham						togethe r	3) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Absence of robust electronic sharing record. 4) Economic - Weak commissioning payment based on episodic care at hospital, PBR incentivises more activity in hospitals, mitigating against other providers, competition within the market and choice and regulation focuses on organisation performance not collective system leading to single outcomes framework 4) Workforce Mana for GPs to adapt to services at a larger 5) Economic - New incentives and loca 6) Economic - Com services based on or rather than items of	provide scale. payment currencies. mission outcomes
R Humphries	2015	Integrated health and social care in England – Progress and prospects	EMCA RE	Health Policy	Report	DOI: 10.101 6/j.heal thpol.2 015.04. 010	1) Organisational Culture - In contrast to the 'Pioneer' programme which has encouraged locally driven, bottom-up innovation, NHS England has adopted a much more prescriptive and top-down approach to the delivery of the Better Care Fund which is driven by an imperative to reduce emergency hospital admissions. 2) Economic - The personal commissioning programme is an entirely different approach again which rests on the ability of individuals rather than organisations to integrate their own care. It remains to be seen how the inevitable tensions between these very different policy levers and	1) Economic - A new settlement that brings together all health and care funding into a single, ring fenced budget and overseen by a single local commissioner.

						implementation styles will play out.	
Rebecca Rosen, James Mountford, Geraint Lewis, Richard Lewis, Jenny Shand and Sara Shaw	Integration in action: four international case studies	N/A - Snowb all	Nuffield Trust	Case Study	URL: https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/rese arch/int egratio n-in- action- four- internat ional- case- studies	- Slow uptake by some physicians due to reluctance to adapt to new methods. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Lack of performance management role (indirect influence). 3) Economic - Limited benefit to individuals in the organisations until payment contracts have been redesigned. 4) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Single condition services risk silos for chronic conditions, fragmenting care for those with multiple chronic complex problems. 5) Political - Inconsistencies in national policy. 6) Intrinsic value of leadership - Variable progress in different localities dependent on local leadership.	Organisational Culture - Patient-centred culture: focus integrated care on patient needs.

								 10) Intrinsic value of leadership - Skilled leaders with ability to win hearts and minds of frontline staff. 11) Organisational Culture - Taking an incremental approach on progress. 12) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Involvement of all relevant health care providers to create broad support. 	
Richard Gleave	2009	Across the pond - Lessons from the US on Integrated Healthcare		Trust	Case Study	URL: https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/rese arch/ac ross- the- pond- lessons- from- integrat ed- healthc are			Intrinsic value of leadership - Integrated governance models must be built on strong clinical leadership, must be combined with a culture that prompts delivery of integrated care. Inter-organisational Collaboration- Risk needs to be shared in Inter- organisational Collaborationrather than assigned individually.
Sara Shaw, Rebecca Rosen and Benedict Rumbold	2011	What is integrated care?	Nuffield Trust	Nuffield Trust	Report	https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/files/ 2017- 01/wha t-is- integrat	Economic - Situate performance measures within wider health and care systems: acknowledge the level and combination of strategies used based on the challenges faced in obtaining appropriate		

						report- web- final.pd f	quality care for local communities and user groups and consider the contextual factors that affect development and delivery. 2) Workforce Management-Standardised, validated tools and indicators that measure integration across different settings relative to a set of models, structures and processes. 3) Workforce Management - Improvement through audit of medical records, analysis of register data on hospitalisation rates, self assessment for managers, annual surveys, questionnaires for clinical leaders, qualitative interviews with executives, leaders, staff and managers.		
Sara Shaw, Ros Levenson	2011	Towards integrated care in Trafford	Nuffield Trust	Nuffield Trust	Report	URL: https:// www.n uffieldtr ust.org. uk/files/ 2017- 01/fow ards- integrat ed- care-in- trafford -web- final.pd			1) Organisational Culture - Recognise that major change is needed, ensure a clear and agreed vision from GPs to specialists. 2) Economic - Work simultaneously with commissioners and service providers so that quality and budgeting is fulfilled. 3) Workforce Management - Make a clear case for change 4) Workforce Management - Engage with stakeholders when developing integrated systems

									5) Intrinsic value of leadership - Facilitate local leadership that has good knowledge of the workings of the local systems.
Sheena Asthana, Felix Gradinger, Julian Elston, Susan Martin, Richard Byng	2020	Capturing the Role of Context in Complex System Change: An Application of the Canadian Context and Capabilities for Integrating Care (CCIC) Framework to an Integrated Care Organisation in the UK.	d	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	Case Study	DOI: 10.533 4/ijic.51 96.		1) Economic - Size/structural factors were key to integration success: the area was sufficiently small (n=36,251) to allow triage, assessment and referral in one multi-disciplinary team (MDT), whereas in the largest locality had 72,692 registered residents so the single MDT initially had much more caseloads which became unmanageable. 2) Organisational Culture - The small size allowed relationships to develop over time; indeed, there is a history of collaboration there (e.g. between GPs and community hospital teams and between health and social care). 3) Intrinsic value of leadership - A strong role of shared, bottom-up leadership. Frontline clinicians in the Coastal Locality were notable for having trusting and friendly relationships between team leads (Physio, Nurses and Matrons, Social Care). 4) Inter-organisational Collaboration- The integrated system appointed GPs as locality clinical directors, which was a key factor as they helped link the GP community directly into the ICO, thereby overcoming barriers between the acute and primary sectors. 5) Organisational Culture - There was a commitment to learning by leaders. The Coastal leads	

									insisted on collecting their own performance data despite being asked to discontinue doing so and devised their own performance management system (measuring performance). Priority to measure performance; there was a willingness in Coastal to genuinely question the process and outcomes of integrated care. 6) Inter-organisational Collaboration- The partnering and the organisation of interprofessional teamwork and joint care planning as critical determinants of success, especially informal partnership which relies on trusting relationships at all levels. A balance of top-down and bottomup committees and system-wide steering functions facilitated the emergence over time of trusting relationships and iteratively evolving teams at locality level. This in turn allowed for better service delivery.	
Sian E. Maslin- Prothero. Amy E. Bennion	2010	Integrated team working: a literature review	HSE	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	System atic Literatu re Review	URL: https:// www.n cobi.nlm. nih.gov /pmc/ar ticles/P MC288 3237/	local and national level, and a recognition of the fundamentally different principles of governance.	Inter-organisational Collaboration- Divide between social care staff medical staff: differences in geographical boundaries, communication boundaries, and status inequalities. Organisational Culture - The mismatch in cultures, behaviours and understanding of services creates a divide between the disciplines. Organisational boundaries resulted in staff feeling pressured, and the process		

commitment to, the vision of the venture across the organizations involved. 3) Inter-organisational Collaboration- It is important for integrated services to work together across agency boundaries; this has been facilitated by the removal of structural constraints through the Health Act 1999, which permitting pooled budgets and integrated to acknape knowledge asaliy between agencies; effective shared information technology (IT) systems are key to the success of integrated working. 5) Organisational Culture - Need for the development of a shared culture. 6) Workforce Management - Establishment of new toyle to support new working. 5) Organisational Culture - Need for the development of a shared culture. 6) Workforce Management - Establishment of new toyle to support new working. 5) Organisational Culture - Need for the development of a shared culture. 6) Workforce Management - Establishment of new toyle to support new working. 5) Organisational Culture - Need for the development of a shared culture. 6) Workforce Management - Establishment of new toyle to support new formation and future career structure. 6) Workforce working. 7) Economic - Financial limitations as to what can be addressed with the resources available.
--

							and encouraging local agencies to work together in those areas. 9) Organisational Culture - The promotion of professional values of service to users and socialisation into the immediate work group.			
Stephanie Best	2016	Facilitating integrated delivery of services across organisation al boundaries: Essential enablers to integration	HMIC	British Journal of Occupati onal Therapy	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.117 7/0308 022616 688019	1) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Horizontal communication.	leadership style	1) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Communication: Intra- and Inter-professional; staff kept informed; spontaneously shared knowledge across organisations; top-down communication is acknowledged with the need to set a vision and strategic direction identified within leadership; bottom-up communication is seen as essential to actively supporting new ways of working and to sharing a common understanding of operational circumstances. 2) Intrinsic value of leadership - Setting direction, setting the vision. 3) Intrinsic value of leadership - Accessibility through visibility both within and across organisations. 4) Intrinsic value of leadership - Joint decision-making. 5) Intrinsic value of leadership - Authority to influence across organisations. 6) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Joint training offers an opportunity to build	

							relationships with colleagues across organisations and recognise each other's areas of expertise. Overall, participants expressed a wish to see improved working relationships, as this has the potential to lead to a 'fluidity in thinking' when managing difficult or complex situations.
Sue Mackie, Angela Darvill	2016	Factors enabling implementati on of integrated health and social care: a systematic review	CINAH	Journal of Communi	atic Literatu	DOI: 10.129 6.8/bjc .2016.2 1.2.82	1) Intrinsic value of leadership - Management and leadership support was identified as an enabler in four of the seven studies, with Coupe (2013) suggesting that leadership support was essential for the successful implementation of integrated health and social care teams. 2) Workforce Management - Change management can be complex, and Thomas et al (2006) suggest that changes are more likely to be adopted when the change meets an identified need. Ling et al (2012: 4) support this belief, as they reported that 'where staff felt that change was being forced upon them then they were less likely to support the new activity. 3) Organisational Culture - Ling et al (2012) further reported that pilot sites were more successful when there was evidence of a shared vision, along with a commitment from management in relation to longevity of the change. 4) Intrinsic value of leadership - Thistlethwaite (2011) partially attributed the success in Torbay to the stable leadership within Torbay and the ongoing

	 1	1			
				managerial support to deliver on	
				the integration project.	
				5) Economic - Resources and	
				capacity have been identified as a	
				key enabler in five out of the	
				seven studies. Coupe (2013)	
				attributed the main cause of	
				under-performance of the	
				integrated health and social care	
				teams to a lack of investment in	
				the teams, which is required to	
				embed the change into practice.	
				Ling et al (2012) also reported that	
				the lack of resources in the	
				integrated health and social care	
				teams resulted in an increased	
				workload, which had an adverse	
				effect on staff motivation.	
				6) Political - National policy was	
				considered an enabler in four of	
				the studies. Coupe (2013)	
				identified that the NHS payment	
				systems, such as payment by	
				results and block contracts, do not	
				incentivise the delivery of care in	
				the community, and thus pose a	
				barrier to integrated health and	
				social care teams.	
				7) Economic - Sheaff et al (2009)	
				also referred to the NHS financial	
				system, suggesting that paying	
				hospitals for each case treated	
				was an actual incentive to	
				increase admissions, which	
				completely conflicts with the aims	
				of integrated health and social	
				care teams.	
				ouro tourno.	
				8) Inter-organisational	
				Collaboration- Shared information	
				technology (IT) systems were	
				identified as an enabler in two	
				studies. This may pose a concern	
				for a number of organisations	
				ioi a number of organisations	

							considering data sharing owing to issues with information governance and maintaining patient confidentiality.	
Tom Ling, Laura Brereton, Annalijn Conklin	2012	Barriers and facilitators to integrating care: experiences from the English Integrated Care Pilots	Internatio nal Journal of Integrate d Care	Qualitat ive Study	DOI: 10.533 4/ijic.98 2	- Size and complexity: multiple components in integration reported greater challenges of managing change, and they were often greater and longer to implement than they had anticipated. Difficult to	1) Workforce Management - Size and complexity: simple, smaller integration made more rapid progress and had the ability and authority to come to quick decisions. 2) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Compatible IT systems and good management of the sharing of private data. 3) Inter-organisational Collaboration-Good existing relationships between individuals and/or organisations with clear communication about the contributions required from different participants and the rules governing how the partnership should work. 4) Organisational Culture - Widespread agreement and shared values among participating staff promoted engagement and motivation. 5) Intrinsic value of leadership - Success when senior management or team leaders were perceived to be strongly committed to implementing lasting change. 6) Inter-organisational Collaboration- Ongoing, planned communication between senior executives in the partner	

		they were permitted to take	organisations. 7) Inter-	
		on particular tasks or	organisational Collaboration- Co-	
		feeling unprepared to take	location: working together face-to-	
		on new roles.	face in the same building	
			improved the quality and	
		4) Inter-organisational	frequency of communication, and	
		Collaboration- Different IT	expedited problem-solving by	
			allowing quicker access to	
		organisations caused	colleagues' professional	
		difficulties in data-sharing	knowledge. 8) Organisational	
		and communicating,	Culture - Feelings of being	
		especially across health	involved with planning from the	
		and social care teams. On	beginning. 9) Workforce	
			Management - Staff were	
		were not caused by the II	motivated when there was clear	
		itself but by how their	and consistent communication	
		introduction was managed,	from leaders within organisations	
		such as failure to address	about what work was required and	
		privacy concerns where	contribution needed from	
		organisations were	participants. 10) Organisational	
		reluctant to share patient	Culture - Willingness to engage.	
		data.	Creating shared beliefs about the	
		5, 0 11 1. 5	benefits of change was described	
		3) Collaboration between	by staff as critical to progress. 11)	
		Organisations. Absence of	Intrinsic value of leadership -	
		relationships between	'Good' leadership. 12) Workforce	
		individuals and/or	Management - Thorough training	
		organisations. Poor	led to staff being clear whether	
		communication and	they were permitted to take on	
		disagreement about the	particular tasks or feeling	
		contributions required from	prepared to take on new roles.	
		different participants and	The provision of training specific	
		the rules governing now	to the service change was	
		trie partifership should	important, particularly when the	
		work.	work involved required new or	
		6) Inter-organisational	changed roles of participants. 13)	
			Organisational Culture -	
		ongoing, planned	Supportive, transparent	
		communication between	organisational culture: the ability	
			to modify existing systems and	
		partner organisations.	practices and to create new ones	
		partitor organisations.	was especially dependent on	
		7) Inter-organisational	organisational culture which	
			included local perceptions of	
			professional boundaries. 14)	
			Workforce Management - External	

organisations and slow

	distribution were perceived as a barrier to innovation. 15) Economic - Staff cuts.	