

**Supplementary Table:** Summary of the themes which emerged from the semi-structured interviews

Themes	Participant 1	Participant 2	Participant 3	Participant 4	Participant 5	Participant 6	Participant 7	Participant 8	Participant 9	Participant 10	Total
<b>Use of PBAS to derive education value</b>											
Questionable Educational value	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Form filling / tick box exercise	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Can be used well / provide benefit	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X		8
Generates training			X	X	X	X	X	X		X	7
Fit for purpose? / specificity required	X		X		X		X	X		X	6
Formalisation of training	X			X	X	X	X				5
Quality of assessment?	X	X	X			X				X	5
Improved confidence	X	X		X			X				4
Holistic assessment / technical and non-technical	X	X								X	3
Learning non-technical skills	X	X									2
Increased worth with increased complexity	X		X		X						3
Not level of training specific	X					X				X	3
Too focused on basic competencies				X							1
Examination of thought process	X								X		1
Need to review and generate targets based on previous PBA			X								1
Insufficient feedback / need for feedback			X			X	X		X	X	5
Superfluous content / too generic	X		X	X	X					X	5
Insufficient discussion	X		X		X	X					4
Expand PBA repertoire	X	X				X					3
Takes away from other elements of training	X					X					2

Learning from mistakes	X										1
Facilitates identification of good trainers		X									1
Value of documenting progression		X		X	X	X	X	X			6
Focusing of training / identify areas for development	X		X	X			X	X	X		6
Not valid	X			X	X	X			X		5
Improved the quality of feedback				X	X		X	X			4
Exploratory questioning	X										1
<b>Use of PBAs for Assessment</b>											
Form filling / tick box exercise	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Numbers required	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	9
Obstruction from seniors / lack of support / engagement		X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	8
Timing of assessment (retrospective or prospective)	X		X	X		X	X			X	6
Use as summative tool (for/against)					X	X	X		X	X	5
(Over)simplification of assessment process	X				X		X			X	4
Trainees fill own forms	X		X		X	X				X	5
Trainees misleading trainers	X				X	X	X				4
Formative?	X	X			X		X				4
Additional hurdle	X			X				X			3
Expand PBA repertoire	X	X				X					3
Not level of training specific	X					X				X	3
Variation in use	X	X		X							3
Identify trainees in trouble?					X	X					2
Unrealistic expectations of ability										X	1
Too focused on basic competencies				X							1
Need for greater evidence base					X						1
Examination of thought process	X								X		1
Sign off = competent?				X							1
Limited / No review of free text responses by assessors	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Structured assessment	X			X	X		X	X	X	X	7



technical											
Learning non-technical skills	X	X									2
Develop rapport with trainers		X									1
Facilitates identification of good trainers		X									1
Identify trainees in trouble?					X	X					2
Learning from mistakes	X										1
Positive feelings		X									1
<b>Limitations and areas for Improvement</b>											
Educational value?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Form filling / tick box exercise	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Limited / No review of free text responses by assessors	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Time consuming / hassle	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Trainer dependent	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Numbers required	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	9
Obstruction from seniors / lack of support / engagement		X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	8
Stressful	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X		8
Value of documenting progression		X		X	X	X	X	X			6
Apologetic stance	X	X			X	X	X				5
Insufficient feedback / need for feedback			X			X	X		X	X	5
Need for trainer impetus to do PBAs / dedicated training list	X	X						X	X	X	5
Not valid	X			X	X	X			X		5
No safety benefit				X	X		X		X	X	5
Superfluous content / too generic	X		X	X	X					X	5
Trainees fill own forms	X		X		X	X				X	5
(Over)simplification of assessment process	X				X		X			X	4
Trainees misleading trainers	X				X	X	X				4
Being told	X			X				X	X		4
Insufficient discussion	X		X		X	X					4
Additional hurdle	X			X				X			3
Ambiguity	X				X	X					3

Expand PBA repertoire	X	X				X					3
Not level of training specific	X					X				X	3
Variation in use	X	X		X							3
Takes away from other elements of training	X					X					2
Trainer concentrating on assessment during case	X					X					2
Increasing difficulty with seniority to complete (less supervision) / less useful with seniority							X			X	2
Resentment of the process				X				X			2
Unrealistic expectations of ability										X	1
Too focused on basic competencies				X							1
Need for greater evidence base					X						1
Deprofessionalisation?	X										1
<b>Other</b>											
Mixed feelings	X	X	X	X	X						5
Culture of training	X	X						X			3
Loss of candour	X										1

PBA, procedure-based assessment.